

## Contents

<b>1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. Rationale.....	1
1.2. Overview.....	3
1.2.1. Homeopathy's place in the history of therapeutics.....	3
1.2.2. Homeopathy and the development of clinical evaluation.....	4
1.2.3. Is homeopathy clinically relevant?.....	5
1.2.4. Retrospect and prospect.....	5
<b>Parti:</b>	
<b>Homeopathy's Place in the History of Therapeutics</b>	
<b>2. Homeopathy and 'the progress of science'.....</b>	<b>9</b>
2.1. Introduction.....	9
2.2. Philosophy, medicine and the <i>Aufldrung</i> .....	11
2.3. Conceptual foundation of homeopathy.....	14
2.4. The appearance of the <i>Organon</i> .....	18
2.5. The structure of the <i>Organon</i> .....	20
2.6. Hahnemann and the academy.....	26
2.7. The transformations of the <i>Organon</i> .....	27
2.8. The grounds for rejection.....	30
<b>3. Origins of Hahnemann's pharmacognosy and     miasmatic theory.....</b>	<b>35</b>
3.1. The main objections.....	35
3.2. Hahnemann and alchemy.....	37
3.3. Pharmacology.....	39
3.3.1. Similar and signatures.....	39
3.3.2. Drug tests.....	41
3.3.3. Therapeutic poisons and the minimum dose.....	42
3.3.4. Drug preparation.....	44

3.4. Disease theory.....	47
3.4.1. Acute 'miasms'.....	47
3.4.2. Sources of acute 'miasm' theory.....	51
3.4.3. Chronic disease theory.....	54
3.5. Discussion.....	58
<b>4. Homeopathy after Hahnemann.....</b>	<b>63</b>
4.1. The division.....	63
4.2. Symptomatic classical homeopathy.....	64
4.2.1. Directions of cure.....	64
4.2.2. Repertories and keynotes.....	65
4.2.3. Constitutional types.....	66
4.3. Nosological and pathological homeopathy.....	67
4.3.1. Clinical.....	68
4.3.2. Complex.....	69
4.3.3. Isopathy and nosodes.....	70
4.4. Parahomeopathic concepts and homeopathic neorationalism.....	72
4.4.1. Organ remedies.....	72
4.4.2. Biochemic tissue salts.....	72
4.4.3. Constitutional biotypes and morphology.....	73
4.4.4. Spiritual neorationalism.....	74
4.5. The modern synthesis.....	76
4.5.1. Layer theory.....	77
4.5.2. Sequential therapy.....	78
4.6. Conclusion.....	78
<b>Part II:</b>	
<b>Homeopathy and the development of clinical evaluation.</b>	
<b>A systematic review of clinical trials of homeopathy, 1821-1953</b>	
<b>5. Why look at historical trials of homeopathy?.....</b>	<b>87</b>
5.1. The neglect of the pre-modern clinical trial.....	87
5.2. The neglect of homeopathic trials in particular.....	89
5.3. Homeopathic demands for trials.....	90

5.4. Historiography of homeopathic trials.....	91
5.4.1. Internal accounts.....	91
5.4.2. External accounts.....	92
5.3. Justification for reviewing early homeopathic trials.....	93
5.6. Method.....	95
5.7. Results.....	95
<b>4L The earliest observational studies, 1821-35.....</b>	<b>101</b>
6.1. Introduction.....	101
42. Results.....	103
<b>63. Germanic trials.....</b>	<b>104</b>
6.3.1. Berlin 1821: Stapf, Wislicenius.....	104
6.3.2. Vienna 1828: Marenzeller.....	104
6.3.3. Naples 1828: de Horatiis.....	105
6.3.4. Naples 1829: de Horatiis.....	105
6.3.5. Tulzyn 1829: Herrmann.....	106
6.3.6. St Petersburg 1829-30: Herrmann.....	106
6.3.7. Munich 1830-31: Attomyr & Ringseis.....	106
<b>414. French trials.....</b>	<b>107</b>
6.4.1. Lyons 1832: Gueyrard.....	107
6.4.2. Paris 1834: Andral.....	108
6.4.3. Paris 1835: Andral.....	109
6.4.4. Paris 1834: Simon, Curie.....	110
<b>415. Discussion.....</b>	<b>111</b>
<b>7. Comparisons with allopathy, 1844-86.....</b>	<b>113</b>
<b>1.1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>113</b>
TO. Results.....	114
7.2.1. Miskolcz, Austro-Hungary 1844: general.....	117
7.2.2. St Petersburg 1847-54: general.....	117
7.2.3. Paris 1847^9: pneumonia.....	118
7.2.4. Paris 1849: cholera.....	120
7.2.5. Paris 1849-51: general.....	120
7.2.6. Vienna 1850-59: pneumonia.....	122
7.2.7. London 1854: scarlet fever prevention.....	123
7.2.8. Marseilles 1854: cholera.....	123

7.2.9. London 1854: cholera.....	124
7.2.10. Glasgow 1870s: mixed fevers.....	130
7.2.11. Chicago 1880-86: general.....	130
7.3. Discussion.....	131
7.3.1. Planning and design.....	131
7.3.2. Generalizability.....	133
7.3.3. Reception.....	134
<b>8. Placebo controls - in trials and in practice, 1810-1920 ....</b>	<b>137</b>
8.1. Introduction.....	137
8.2. Placebo-controlled provings.....	138
8.3. Therapeutic trials involving placebo.....	142
8.3.1. Placebo-controlled trials.....	142
8.3.2. Trials of placebo without homeopathic treatment.....	142
8.4. Placebo in homeopathic practice.....	144
8.4.1. Hahnemannian usage.....	144
8.4.2. Early adoption by followers.....	145
8.4.3. Hahnemannian placebos in trials.....	146
8.4.4. Divided doses and placebo.....	147
8.4.5. Later evidence.....	148
8.5. Discussion.....	149
<b>9. Adoption of the biomedical research perspective, 1914-53.....</b>	<b>155</b>
9.1. Introduction.....	155
9.2. Results.....	156
9.3. USA 1914-38.....	156
9.3.1. Boston 1914: scarlet fever.....	160
9.3.2. Boston 1914-16: scarlet fever.....	160
9.3.3. Boston 1915: diphtheria.....	161
9.3.4. Boston 1917: scarlet fever.....	161
9.3.5. Boston 1921-23: mumps.....	162
9.3.6. New York 1938: URTI.....	162
9.4. Germany 1925-42.....	163
9.4.1. Berlin 1925: furunculosis.....	165
9.4.2. Berlin 1925: skin conditions.....	165

9.4.3. Hamburg 1938-39: pertussis.....	166
9.4.4. ? 1942: diphtheria.....	166
9.5. Great Britain 1941-53.....	167
9.5.1. Glasgow 1941: diphtheria.....	168
9.5.2. Glasgow & London 1941-42: mustard gas burns.....	169
9.5.3. Burton-on-Trent, 1951-53: surgical tuberculosis.....	171
9.6. Discussion.....	171
9.6.1. Conditions treated.....	171
9.6.2. National styles of homeopathy.....	172
9.6.3. Trial design.....	174

### Part III:

#### Is homeopathy clinically relevant?

#### A systematic review of clinical trials, 1940-98

<b>10. Rationale.....</b>	<b>179</b>
10.1 Previous reviews of homeopathic clinical trials.....	179
10.2 Is another systematic review of homeopathic trials justified?.....	183
<b>11. Methods.....</b>	<b>185</b>
11.1. Literature search and data sources.....	185
11.2. Language restrictions.....	185
11.3. Inclusion and exclusion criteria.....	186
11.3.1. Therapy definition.....	186
11.3.2. Medicine definition.....	186
11.3.3. Trial design.....	186
11.4. Data extraction.....	187
11.5. Representing strength of results.....	188
11.6. Methodological quality instrument.....	189
11.7. Clinical relevance instrument.....	193
11.8. Quality control and data integrity.....	194
11.9. Sensitivity analysis and statistics.....	194

<b>12. Results.....</b>	<b>195</b>
12.1. Design.....	196
12.2. Intrahomeopathic differences.....	198
12.3. Treatment effects.....	201
12.4. Adverse reactions.....	202
12.5. Holism, quality of life and economic evaluation.....	203
12.6. Methodological quality.....	204
12.6.1 Comparison with other quality scales.....	208
12.7. Highest quality trials.....	209
12.8. Clinical relevance.....	210
<b>13. Discussion.....</b>	<b>211</b>
13.1. Overview.....	211
13.2. Efficacy.....	211
13.2.1. Classical.....	212
13.2.2. Clinical.....	215
13.2.3. Complex.....	219
13.2.4. Isopathy.....	221
13.3. Safety.....	222
13.4. Holism, quality of life and economic evaluation.....	224
13.4.1. Comorbidity and wellbeing.....	224
13.4.2. Quality of life.....	225
13.4.3. Economic evaluation.....	225
13.5. Methodological quality measurement.....	226
13.6. Clinical relevance.....	227
13.6.1. Placebo problems.....	228
13.6.2. Pragmatic trials.....	229
13.6.3. Randomization and patient preferences.....	230
13.6.4. Intrahomeopathic comparisons.....	231
13.6.5. Clinically relevant trial proposals.....	232
13.7. Limitations of the present review.....	235
13.8. Further recommendations.....	236

**Part IV: Conclusion**

<b>14. Retrospect and prospect</b> .....	<b>241</b>
<b>t Homeopathy's</b> place in the history of therapeutics.....	241
<b>It Homeopathy</b> and the development of clinical evaluation.....	244
<b>HI: Is homeopathy</b> clinically relevant?.....	245
<b>Appendices</b> .....	248
<b>Glossary</b> .....	249
<b>Abbreviations</b> and symbols used in tables.....	252
<b>References</b> .....	<b>253</b>
<b>Tnal reports</b> 1821-1954 (Part II).....	253
<b>Tml reports</b> 1941-98 (Part III).....	257
<b>Excluded</b> .....	257
<b>Included</b> .....	262
<b>General references</b> .....	276